

San Diego Public Workshop on the draft CalEnviroScreen 3.0

September 13, 2016

Cesar E. Chavez Campus: San Diego Continuing Education
1901 Main Street, San Diego, CA 92113



The third regional workshop on the CalEnviroScreen 3.0 draft in Los Angeles was an opportunity for the public to learn about updates to the tool and provide comments on these updates. The workshop attracted over 30 participants from community organizations, local and state government, as well as residents.

Staff sought comments and suggestions related to the four major components of CalEnviroScreen—exposures, environmental effects, sensitive populations and socioeconomic factors. Comments from workshop participants are listed below. Similar or related comments were consolidated and placed in the most appropriate category.

General Comments

- Provide regional analyses of CalEnviroScreen.
- OEHHA needs to speak with decision makers at different levels to tell them how to use CalEnviroScreen for disadvantaged communities.
- Do a time analysis of CalEnviroScreen data
 - How or can one characterize trends between 2.0 and 3.0?
 - There should be a slider maps to compare CalEnviroScreen 2.0 to 3.0.
 - CalEnviroScreen continues to provide a snapshot – it needs to be able to track changes over time.
- Guidance from Secretary/CalEPA to include permitting.

New Indicator Ideas

- Add greenhouse gas emissions as a factor. Climate change is one of the biggest threats to many California communities and has an impact on many of the other threats being looked at. This is doubly important because the state allocates funds for greenhouse gas emissions reduction programs based on their score.
- Include sea level rise
 - Sea level rise not only affects rich people that live on the seashore but also poor people that live by the Tijuana river and estuary. Extreme events (flooding and storm) bring pollution on the land.
 - In the future, it would be good to integrate communities impacted by global warming and sea level rise.
- Homeless population
 - Add homeless population as an indicator. Homelessness getting to be a huge problem. Vulnerable population in and of themselves but also have environmental and social impact on those living in the communities they are present in.

- Proximity or access to transportation should be considered.
- Families suffering from separation issues around immigration problems. Overcrowding is another immigration-related issue.
- Access to healthy fresh foods/green space. Check out CA health atlas.
- Migrant workers – see whether school districts track this type of information.
- Participants from local water organizations recommend reviewing underserved community's layers (URC – underrepresented communities; EDA – economically distressed areas)

Comments on the removal of the age indicator:

- Agree with the decision to remove the age indicator. It improved the model.
- San Diego Association of Government's (SANDAG) wants to keep the age indicator because it is used in the region for their work.

Comments on the Rent-Adjusted Income Indicator

- Support for inclusion of the rent-adjusted income indicator.
- Worry that median household income is too high a number to use for the most vulnerable people in the communities.
- Gentrification is causing rents to go up very high in areas like Barrio Logan while the local population is seeing no increase in salaries.
- Concern that the data lags too far behind rapidly changing housing costs in recent years.
- Some consideration should be given to how fast rent is increasing in certain areas as part of vulnerability.
- Coronado appears high scoring in the rent-adjusted income indicator despite the fact it is a very rich community.
- Maybe cap the income at some level?
- Why not include number of investment properties in an area or homeowners versus renters in an area?

Comments regarding changes to the US-Mexico border

- In support of changes at the border
 - Great improvement of CalEnviroScreen to include pollution from Mexican side.
 - Exciting that you have new air data with monitors.
- Are you considering having the equivalent to CalEnviroScreen on the other side of the border (for Mexican population)? A CES for 100KM both side of the border?
- Roadways 150 meters from border such as Via Rapida but other congested highways exist that are further and have high traffic.

- Air quality data is very situational. Depends on diffusion, meteorology (temperature, wind), topography. You should do modeling to estimate concentration not just distance.
- For modeling traffic density, check AERMOD/USEPA.
- There is a railroad on Mexican side at Tecate, San Ysidro, and Calexico— big cargo trains/ diesel exhaust.
- Vehicles, buses and trucks are much older on the other side of the border.
- How about air pollution from airports? Three big ones here (one in Mexico and two in US)?
- After the drought when rains come, there is a lot of things in the water, lots of contamination.
- Concern about traffic crossing the border. Traffic is heavy and wait time long at the border: Accumulation of diesel pollution.
- Should consider using border wait time as an indicator of traffic congestion.

Exposures

- Provide additional diesel modeling details and how it is different from CES 2.0.
- Ozone mapping is better with this version.
- Can you say or establish a safe level based on cumulative impacts?
- ARB doesn't support TRI. Can ARB provide a better toxics data than TRI?
- Diesel characterization in 3.0 has helped National City but not other cities. Why?
- Consistent and clear legends for the maps
- Include data on vector control chemicals used in the area. Is data available?
- Can age of housing be included since it is a risk factor?
- Check the correctness of the traffic data at Camp Pendleton and the South Bay.
- The Department of Pesticide Regulation has some data on nonstructural pesticides, explore the option of inclusion.
- Support for diesel characterization in this version.

Environmental Effects

- Tijuana River
 - Water pollution of Tijuana river affects health, economy and environment (endangered species). It's been a multi-decade process to address this issue in our city.
 - The Tijuana River is the only river to flow north and it's affecting lots of places. It has phosphorescent color and solid waste in are visible.
- In the south, we have different issues with air pollution and impaired water bodies.
- Consider the Irrigated Lands Regulatory Program waste discharge requirements; the California Environmental Data Exchange Network (CEDEN) stores information on

agriculture related discharges to surface and ground water in agricultural communities.

- Agriculture has impacts in the northern part of San Diego County.
- Beach closures should be included (number of days closed for health reasons)
- Sewage spills and operational upsets should be included (California Integrated Water Quality System data).
- Cholla Creek has experienced sewage spills; the pipeline has broken on more than one occasion.
- CIWQS has information on violations that are not included in CalRecycle's data.
- CalEnviroScreen should use land use classifications: industrial, residential, open space.
- Are local hazardous waste permits included, they should be? Many census tracts seem to have nothing, but there are surf shops that create hazardous waste.
- The Impaired Water Bodies indicator should include the degree of impairment.
- Camp Pendleton contributes to impacts.
- Is coal ash considered hazardous waste and is it included in CalEnviroScreen?
- Confused about why there is so much variability in the San Diego Bay.
- Puzzled by why there are no hazardous waste sites in Pacific Beach; there should at least be generators.
- Dry cleaners should be included in ground water threats.
- Waste water treatment plants should be included in CalEnviroScreen.

Socioeconomic Factors

- Population characteristics data: are you planning to disaggregate to smaller census units?

Sensitive Populations

- For the new cardiovascular disease indicator, why do you rely only on emergency department visits? Poor people wait until they have no other choices except to go to an emergency room.
- In the border area, some residents may go to Mexico for emergency care. The indicators that rely on CA ED visits may undercount total ED visits.
- The large military population in some census tracts could skew things. One National City census tract is ranked 13th in asthma, but only 1000 of the approximately 5000 official population of the tract actually live there on an ongoing basis. The other 4,000 people in the census tract are military.
- Many liked the idea of coming up with an absolute scoring system for the sensitive populations indicators to track trends over time.
- Could you do a time-series analysis of these indicators to see how asthma, low birthweight and cardiovascular disease rates are changing over time?